

Title: Opening Talk

Speakers:

Collection: 50 Years of Horndeski Gravity: Exploring Modified Gravity

Date: July 15, 2024 - 9:15 AM

URL: <https://pirsa.org/24070027>

50 Years of Horndeski Gravity: The Beginning

Gregory Horndeski

Department of Applied Mathematics,
University of Waterloo



$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{L} = & \sqrt{g} \left\{ \mathcal{U}_1 \Gamma_{\lambda\mu\nu}^{\alpha\beta\gamma} \varphi_\alpha^\lambda R_{\beta\gamma}^{\mu\nu} + \frac{2}{3} \mathcal{U}_{1x} \delta_{\lambda\mu\nu}^{\alpha\beta\gamma} \varphi_\alpha^\lambda \varphi_\beta^\mu \varphi_\gamma^\nu \right\} + \\ & + \sqrt{g} \left\{ \mathcal{U}_3 \Gamma_{\lambda\mu\nu}^{\alpha\beta\gamma} \varphi_\alpha^\lambda R_{\beta\gamma}^{\mu\nu} + 2\mathcal{U}_{3x} \delta_{\lambda\mu\nu}^{\alpha\beta\gamma} \varphi_\alpha^\lambda \varphi_\beta^\mu \varphi_\gamma^\nu \right\} + \\ & + \sqrt{g} \left\{ [F+2W] \delta_{\lambda\mu}^{\alpha\beta} R_{\alpha\beta}^{\lambda\mu} + 2F_x \delta_{\lambda\mu}^{\alpha\beta} \varphi_\alpha^\lambda \varphi_\beta^\mu \right\} + \\ & + \sqrt{g} \left\{ 2\mathcal{U}_8 \delta_{\lambda\mu}^{\alpha\beta} \varphi_\alpha^\lambda \varphi_\beta^\mu - 6 [F_\varphi + 2W_\varphi - X\mathcal{U}_8] D\varphi \right\} + \sqrt{g} \mathcal{U}_9 \end{aligned}$$

$$X := -\frac{1}{2} g^{\alpha\beta} \varphi_\alpha \varphi_\beta, \quad \varphi_\alpha := \nabla_\alpha \varphi; \quad \varphi_{\alpha\beta} := \nabla_\beta \nabla_\alpha \varphi; \quad F = F(\varphi, X)$$

$$F_X := 2(\mathcal{U}_3 + 2X\mathcal{U}_{3x} - \mathcal{U}_{1\varphi}); \quad F_x = \frac{\partial F}{\partial X}; \quad F_\varphi := \frac{\partial F}{\partial \varphi}; \quad W = W(X, \varphi)$$

$g = \det(g_{\alpha\beta})$; $\mathcal{U}_1, \mathcal{U}_3, \mathcal{U}_8, \mathcal{U}_9$ ARE ARBITRARY FUNCTIONS OF φ & X . Originally $\mathcal{F} := -2X = \varphi^\alpha \varphi_\alpha$

$$R_{\alpha\mu\nu}^\beta = \Gamma_{\alpha\mu\nu}^\beta - \Gamma_{\alpha\nu\mu}^\beta + \Gamma_{\alpha\mu}^\lambda \Gamma_{\lambda\nu}^\beta - \Gamma_{\alpha\nu}^\lambda \Gamma_{\lambda\mu}^\beta; \quad R_{\alpha\mu} = R_{\alpha\mu\beta}^\beta; \quad R := g^{\alpha\beta} R_{\alpha\beta}$$



5x5 GENERALIZED KRONECKER DELTA

$$\delta_{pqrst}^{abcde} := \det \begin{vmatrix} \delta_p^a & \delta_q^a & \delta_r^a & \delta_s^a & \delta_t^a \\ \delta_p^b & \delta_q^b & \delta_r^b & \delta_s^b & \delta_t^b \\ \vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \vdots & \vdots \\ \delta_p^e & \delta_q^e & \delta_r^e & \delta_s^e & \delta_t^e \end{vmatrix} = \text{WHAT IN A SPACE OF 4-DIMENSIONS?}$$

LOVELOCK (1969)

USE $\delta_{:::}$ TO PROVE DIMENSIONALLY DEPENDENT IDENTITIES, SUCH AS THE LANCZOS IDENTITY: IF $n=4$

$$2R^{ih}R_{jh} + 2R^{hk}R_{hikj} - RR^i_j - R^{hikl}R_{jhkl} = \\ = \frac{1}{4} \delta_j^i (4R^{hk}R_{hk} - R^2 - R^{hkem}R_{hkem})$$

Pf: $0 = \delta_{jqrst}^{ibcde} R_{bc}{}^{qr} R_{de}{}^{st}$ in a 4-SPACE
(2)



PETER BERGMANN (1968)

$$L = L(g_{\alpha\beta}, g_{\alpha\beta, \mu}, g_{\alpha\beta, \mu\nu}; \varphi; \varphi,_{\mu}) \quad (1)$$

$$L_{BD} := \sqrt{g} (\varphi R - \omega X / \varphi); \quad L_B := \sqrt{g} (f_1(\varphi)R + f_2(\varphi)X + f_3(\varphi))$$

REPLACE $f_2(\varphi)X + f_3(\varphi)$ IN L_B BY $\eta = \eta(\varphi, X)$ TO GET

$$\tilde{L}_B := \sqrt{g} (f_1(\varphi)R + \eta(\varphi, X))$$

PROBLEM: DETERMINE IN A SPACE OF 4-DIMENSIONS ALL LAGRANGE SCALAR DENSITIES OF THE FORM GIVEN IN (1) WHICH ARE $\exists E^{\alpha\beta}(L) \delta E(L)$ ARE AT MOST OF 2ND ORDER, WHERE $E^{\alpha\beta}(L) := \frac{\delta L}{\delta g^{\alpha\beta}} + E(L) := \frac{\delta L}{\delta \varphi}$.

(3)



MASTER'S THESIS WAS DEVOTED TO :

- (i) DEVELOPING THE MATHEMATICAL MACHINERY REQUIRED TO SOLVE THE ABOVE PROBLEM; +
- (ii) INVESTIGATING BRANS-DICKE THEORY.

(i) INVOLVES DEVELOPING THE INVARIANCE IDENTITIES THAT $L = L(g_{\alpha\beta}, g_{\alpha\beta, \mu}, g_{\alpha\beta, \mu\nu}; \varphi; \varphi_{, \mu})$ SATISFIES + SHOWING THAT

$$E^{\alpha\beta}(L)_{\alpha\beta} = \frac{1}{2} \varphi^{\alpha} E_{\alpha}(L)$$

MASTER'S THESIS WAS FINISHED IN FEB. 1971

(4)



USING LOVELOCK'S (1969) RESULT ON THE FORM OF THE MOST GENERAL 2ND ORDER METRIC LAGRANGIAN THAT YIELDS 2ND ORDER FIELD EQS WE PROVED

THEOREM (HORNDZESKI & LOVELOCK (1972)): IN A SPACE OF 4-DIMENSIONS THE MOST GENERAL LAGRANGIAN OF THE FORM $L = L(g_{\alpha\beta}; g_{\alpha\beta,\mu}; g_{\alpha\beta,\mu\nu}; \varphi; \varphi_{,\mu})$ WHICH IS $\exists E(ML) + E(L)$ ARE AT MOST 2ND ORDER IS

$$L_{HL} := \sqrt{-g} \left\{ f_1(\varphi) [R^2 - 4R_{\alpha\beta} R^{\alpha\beta} + R_{\alpha\beta\mu\nu} R^{\alpha\beta\mu\nu}] + f_2(\varphi) \frac{1}{2} \varphi_{,\mu} \varphi^{,\mu} G^{\alpha\beta} + f_3(\varphi) R + \eta(\varphi, X) \right\} + K \epsilon^{\alpha\beta\gamma\delta} R^{\lambda\sigma}{}_{\alpha\beta} R_{\lambda\sigma\gamma\delta}.$$



PH.D. PROBLEM: CONSTRUCT IN A SPACE OF 4-DIMENSIONS
THE MOST GENERAL 2ND ORDER SCALAR-TENSOR FIELD
Eqs. DERIVABLE FROM A LAGRANGIAN OF ARBITRARY
DIFFERENTIAL ORDER IN THE DERIVATIVES OF $g_{mn} + \phi$.

KEY TO SOLVING THIS PROBLEM IS THE IDENTITY

$$E^{\alpha\beta}(L)_{|\beta} = \frac{1}{2} \dot{\phi} E(L).$$

PROBLEM: CONSTRUCT IN A SPACE OF 4-DIMENSIONS
ALL PAIRS $(A^{\alpha\beta}, A)$ WHICH ARE \exists : (i) $A^{\alpha\beta}$ & A ARE AT
MOST OF 2ND ORDER IN $g_{mn} + \phi$; (ii) $A^{\alpha\beta} = A^{\beta\alpha}$; \downarrow
(iii) $A^{\alpha\beta}{}_{|\beta} = \frac{1}{2} \dot{\phi} A.$ (6)



TO FIND A LAGRANGIAN THAT CAN YIELD ALL
SUITABLE $(A^{\alpha\beta}, A)$ PAIRS I TRIED $\int_{\mathcal{M}} A^{\alpha\beta}$.

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{L} = & \int_{\mathcal{M}} \left\{ \chi_1 \delta_{\lambda\mu\nu}^{\alpha\beta\gamma} \varphi^\lambda R_{\beta\gamma}^{\mu\nu} + \frac{2}{3} \chi_{1x} \delta_{\lambda\mu\nu}^{\alpha\beta\gamma} \varphi^\lambda \varphi^\mu \varphi^\nu \right\} + \\ & + \int_{\mathcal{M}} \left\{ \chi_3 \delta_{\lambda\mu\nu}^{\alpha\beta\gamma} \varphi^\lambda \varphi^\mu R_{\beta\gamma}^{\nu\alpha} + 2 \chi_{3x} \delta_{\lambda\mu\nu}^{\alpha\beta\gamma} \varphi^\lambda \varphi^\mu \varphi^\nu \right\} + \\ & + \int_{\mathcal{M}} \left\{ [F+2W] \delta_{\lambda\mu}^{\alpha\beta} R_{\alpha\beta}^{\lambda\mu} + 2F_x \delta_{\lambda\mu}^{\alpha\beta} \varphi^\lambda \varphi^\mu \right\} + \\ & + \int_{\mathcal{M}} \left\{ 2\chi_3 \delta_{\lambda\mu}^{\alpha\beta} \varphi^\lambda \varphi^\mu - 6[F_\varphi + 2W_\varphi - X\chi_3] \square \varphi \right\} + \int_{\mathcal{M}} \chi_7 \end{aligned}$$

$$X := -\frac{1}{2} g^{\alpha\beta} \varphi_\alpha \varphi_\beta ; \quad \varphi_\alpha = \nabla_\alpha \varphi ; \quad \varphi_{\alpha\beta} := \nabla_\alpha \nabla_\beta \varphi ; \quad F = F(p, X)$$

$$F_x := 2[\chi_3 + 2X\chi_{3x} - \chi_{1\varphi}] ; \quad F_\lambda = \frac{\partial F}{\partial x^\lambda} ; \quad F_\varphi := \frac{\partial F}{\partial \varphi} ; \quad W = W(\varphi).$$

IF $(A^{\alpha\beta}, A)$ ARE REQUIRED TO BE QUASI-LINEAR IN 2ND
DERIVATIVES OF $g_{\alpha\beta}$ THEN \mathcal{L} REDUCES TO LB.
(?)

