Title: Holographic entanglement in spin network states: bulk-to-boundary isometries and horizon-like regions from volume correlations

Speakers: Eugenia Colafranceschi

Series: Quantum Gravity

Date: December 02, 2021 - 2:30 PM

URL: https://pirsa.org/21120012

Abstract: For quantum gravity states associated to open spin network graphs, we study how the boundary (the set of open edges, which carries spin degrees of freedom) is affected by the bulk, specifically by its combinatorial structure and by the quantum correlations among the intertwiners. In particular, we determine under which conditions certain classes of quantum gravity states map bulk degrees of freedom into boundary ones isometrically (which is a necessary condition for holography). We then look at the entanglement entropy of the boundary and recover, for slightly entangled intertwiners, the Ryu-Takayanagi formula with corrections induced by the entanglement entropy of the bulk state. We also show that the presence of a region with highly entangled intertwiners deforms the minimal-area surface, which is prevented from entering that region when the entanglement entropy of the latter exceeds a certain bound, a mechanism which thus leads to the rise of a black hole-like region in the bulk.

Zoom Link: https://pitp.zoom.us/j/96356007543?pwd=U2VrRlhyOThMODdMYllDMnB6VjlZQT09

University of Nottingham



Sfondo tecnologia di rete

HOLOGRAPHIC ENTANGLEMENT IN SPIN NETWORK STATES:

BULK-TO-BOUNDARY ISOMETRIES AND HORIZON-LIKE REGIONS FROM VOLUME CORRELATIONS

Based on work with G. Chirco and D. Oriti 2110.15166, 2105.06454

Eugenia Colafranceschi

Perimeter Institute 2 December 2021

OVERVIEW



- 1. Introduction
- 2. Framework: spin network formalism for quantum spacetime
- 3. Holographic entanglement in spin network states
 - Bulk-to-boundary isometries
 - Horizon-like regions from volume correlations

INTRODUCTION

A deep threefold connection between **gravity**, **holography**, and **entanglement** emerges from results at the transmission between quantum gravity and quantum information:



- I. (Quantum) gravity exhibits holographic features
 - Bekenstein-Hawking area law for black hole entropy;
 - AdS/CFT correspondence and Ryu-Takayanagi formula;
 - Local holography: corner symmetry charges encoding bulk quantum geometry [Freidel, Donnelly...]
 - ...

Entanglement plays a crucial role in the emergence of space(time) geometry/topology

- Entanglement as necessary and sufficient condition for spacetime connectivity [Van Raamsdonk, Maldacena, Susskind];
- **spatial geometries** from **entanglement** structure of **abstract quantum states** [Cao, Carroll, Michalakis];
- Einstein's equations linearized about AdS from entanglement "first law" in CFT [Lashkari, McDermott...]
- ...
- III. Entanglement entropy of (classes of) quantum many-body systems satisfies area laws



Which is the origin of the gravity/holography/entanglement threefold connection, and what does it tell us about quantum gravity?



RESEARCH DIRECTIONS

GEOMETRY/TOPOLOGY FROM QUANTUM INFORMATION

Characterize spin network states from a quantum-information perspective, to facilitate the extraction of geometric and topological features

QUANTUM ORIGIN OF HOLOGRAPHY

Identify properties of the entanglement structure of a spin network which make bulk and boundary holographically related

TOWARDS MODELLING OF BLACK HOLES MICROSTATES

Investigate how entanglement of bulk degrees of freedom affects the boundary state and its entropy

 \rightarrow Horizon-like regions from volume correlations

Remark: we look at finite bounded regions; "local" notion of holography for spin networks



\rightarrow Bulk-to-boundary isometries

SPIN NETWORK FORMALISM FOR QUANTUM SPACETIME

Building block of quantum space as a **spin network vertex**:





SPIN NETWORK FORMALISM FOR QUANTUM SPACETIME



Spin networks = graphs dual to simplicial complexes

- edges carrying SU(2) spins
- nodes carrying intertwiners (gauge invariant tensors)





As kinematical states, spin networks enter* various related QG approaches:

- Loop quantum gravity (canonical quantization of general relativity)
- Spin foam models (covariant LQG or gravity as generalized lattice gauge theory)
- Group field theory (quantum field theory for simplicial geometry)

*with different Hilbert space structures for graph superposition!

SPIN NETWORK FORMALISM FOR QUANTUM SPACETIME - GROUP FIELD THEORY PERSPECTIVE

Spin network states arising from the entanglement of individual vertices (fundamental excitations of the (Eugenia colafrances,

$$\begin{array}{l} \text{Hilbert space}\\ \text{for V open vertices} \end{array} \mathcal{H}_{V} = \bigotimes_{v} \mathcal{H}_{v} \longrightarrow \mathcal{H}_{\gamma} = \bigoplus_{I} \left(\bigotimes_{v} \mathcal{I}^{\vec{j}_{v}} \otimes \bigotimes_{e \in \partial \gamma}^{d} V^{\vec{r}} \right) & \text{Hilbert space}\\ \text{for graph } \gamma \\ J = \{j_{e} | e \in \gamma\} \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{l} |\psi\rangle \xrightarrow{\text{(entangling edge dof)}} & |\psi_{\gamma}\rangle = \left(\bigotimes_{e \in L} \langle e| \right) |\psi\rangle & \text{link state}\\ \uparrow & \uparrow & |e\rangle = \bigoplus_{j} \frac{1}{\sqrt{d_{j}}} \sum_{n} |jn\rangle \otimes |jn\rangle \\ \text{internal links}\\ \text{of combinatorial pattern } \gamma & \text{maximally entangled state}\\ \text{of edge degrees of freedom} \end{array}$$

Page 8/29



ISOMETRY CONDITION

Map-state duality:





OPEN SPIN NETWORK STATES AS BULK-TO-BOUNDARY MAPS



ISOMETRY CONDITION

Map-state duality:





maximally entangled state of two copies of the bulk

Reduced bulk state:



Rényi-2 entropy of a portion *P* of quantum system described by the density matrix ρ :

$$S_2(\rho_P) = -\log \operatorname{Tr}\left(\rho_P^2\right) \qquad \text{replica trick:} \qquad S_2(\rho_P) = -\log\left(\frac{Z_1}{Z_0}\right) \qquad Z_1 = \operatorname{Tr}\left[\left(\rho \otimes \rho\right) \mathcal{S}_P\right] \\ Z_0 = \operatorname{Tr}\left[\rho \otimes \rho\right] \qquad \uparrow$$

operator swapping the two copies of subsystem P

$$\overrightarrow{S_2(\rho_{A\cup\Omega})} \approx -\log\left(\frac{\overline{Z_1}}{\overline{Z_0}}\right) \quad \text{with} \quad \overline{Z_{1/0}} = \operatorname{Tr}\left[\bigotimes_{e \in L} \left(|e\rangle\langle e|\right)^{\otimes 2} \bigotimes_{v} \overline{\left(|f_v\rangle\langle f_v|\right)^{\otimes 2}} \left(S_{A\cup\Omega}/\mathbb{I}\right)\right]$$
boundary bulk portion

large spins regime





CHECKING THE ISOMETRIC CHARACTER OF BULK-TO-BOUNDARY MAPS – HOMOGENEOUS CASE X = region in which the Ising spins point down $|\partial X| \log d_j > |X| \log D_j \quad \forall X$ stability of the all-up configuration graphs made of four-valent vertices $|\partial X| > |X| \quad \forall X$ violated

The bulk-to-boundary map of homogeneous graphs made of four-valent vertices (with at most one boundary link for each vertex) cannot be an isometry

Inhomogeneous case

$$\beta = \log d$$
 average link dimension

Ising-like Hamiltonian:

$$H(\vec{\sigma}) = -\frac{1}{2} \left[\sum_{e \in L} (\sigma_v \sigma_w - 1) \frac{\log d_{j_e}}{\beta} + \sum_{e \in \partial \gamma} (\sigma_v - 1) \frac{\log d_{j_e}}{\beta} + \sum_v (\sigma_v \nu_v - 1) \frac{\log D_{\vec{j}v}}{\beta} \right]$$

CHECKING THE ISOMETRIC CHARACTER OF BULK-TO-BOUNDARY MAPS - INHOMOGENEOUS CAS



Isometry condition as stability of the all-up configuration: $\beta H(\vec{\sigma}) > \log\left(\prod_{v} D_{\vec{j}v}\right) \quad \forall \vec{\sigma}$ 4-valent vertices $j_a \leq j_b \leq j_c \leq j_d$

intertwiner dimension $D_{\vec{j}} = \min\{j_a + j_d, j_b + j_c\} - \Delta + 1$ with $\Delta = j_d - j_a = j_{\text{max}} - j_{\text{min}}$ inhomogeneity of vertex structure

stability of the all-up configuration:

$$\sum_{e \in \partial X} \log d_{j_e} > \sum_{v \in X} \log \left(\min\{j_v^a + j_v^d, j_v^b + j_v^c\} - \Delta_v + 1 \right) \quad \forall X$$

- $\Delta_v = 0 \; \forall v$ homogeneous case, the bulk-to-boundary map is not an isometry
- $\Delta_v = \Delta_{v_{\mathsf{max}}} 1 \ \forall v$ the stability condition becomes

$$\sum_{e \in \partial X} \log d_{j_e} > |X| \log 2 \quad \forall X$$

increasing the inhomogeneity of the spin assignment increases the holographic character of the map!



HOLOGRAPHIC ENTANGLEMENT IN SPIN NETWORK STATES: HORIZON-LIKE REGIONS FROM VOLUME CORRELATIONS

BOUNDARY ENTROPY FOR RANDOM SPIN NETWORK

 $|\psi_{\partial\gamma}(\zeta)\rangle = \underbrace{\langle \zeta|}_{e \in L} \left(\bigotimes_{e \in L} \langle e| \right) \bigotimes_{v} \underbrace{|f_v\rangle}_{v}$

Consider the **boundary state** resulting from the application of **M** to a bulk state $|\zeta\rangle$:

What is its boundary entropy and how the bulk state affects it? $\overline{S_2(\rho_A)} \approx -\log\left(\frac{\overline{Z_1}}{\overline{Z_0}}\right)$ $\overline{Z_{1/0}} = \operatorname{Tr}\left[\underbrace{(|\zeta\rangle\langle\zeta|)^{\otimes 2}}_{\text{bulk contribution}} \bigotimes_{e \in L} (|e\rangle\langle e|)^{\otimes 2} \bigotimes_{v} \underbrace{(|f_v\rangle\langle f_v|)^{\otimes 2}}_{\text{lsing spins } \vec{\sigma}} \underbrace{(S_A/\mathbb{I})}_{\text{boundary fields } \vec{\mu}}\right] = \sum_{\vec{\sigma}} e^{-\mathcal{A}_{1/0}(\vec{\sigma})}$ $\mathcal{A}_{1/0}(\vec{\sigma}) = -\frac{1}{2} \sum_{e \in L} (\sigma_v \sigma_w - 1) \log d_{j_e} - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{e \in \partial \gamma} (\sigma_v \mu_e - 1) \log d_{j_e} + \underbrace{S_2(\zeta; \downarrow)}_{\text{bulk entropy in \downarrow-region}}$

BOUNDARY ENTROPY FOR RANDOM SPIN NETWORK

What is its boundary entropy and how the bulk state affects it?

 $|\psi_{\partial\gamma}(\zeta)\rangle = \underbrace{\langle \zeta|}_{e \in L} \left(\bigotimes_{e \in L} \langle e|\right) \bigotimes_{v} \underbrace{|f_{v}\rangle}_{v}$

Consider the **boundary state** resulting from the application of **M** to a bulk state $|\zeta\rangle$:

 $\overline{S_2(\rho_A)} \approx -\log\left(\frac{Z_1}{\overline{Z_0}}\right)$

 $\mathcal{A}_{1/0}(\vec{\sigma}) = -\frac{1}{2} \sum_{e \in L} (\sigma_v \sigma_w - 1) \log d_{j_e} - \frac{1}{2} \sum_{e \in \partial \gamma} (\sigma_v \mu_e - 1) \log d_{j_e} + \underbrace{S_2(\zeta; \downarrow)}_{\text{bulk entropy in }\downarrow\text{-region}}$ $\overline{S_2(\rho_A)} \approx -\log\left(\frac{\overline{Z_1}}{\overline{Z_0}}\right) = F_1 - F_0$

 $\overline{Z_{1/0}} = \operatorname{Tr} \left[\underbrace{(|\zeta\rangle\langle\zeta|)^{\otimes 2}}_{\text{bulk contribution}} \bigotimes_{e \in L} (|e\rangle\langle e|)^{\otimes 2} \bigotimes_{v} \underbrace{(|f_v\rangle\langle f_v|)^{\otimes 2}}_{\text{lsing spins } \vec{\sigma}} \underbrace{(S_A/\mathbb{I})}_{\text{boundary fields } \vec{\mu}} \right] = \sum_{\vec{\sigma}} e^{-\mathcal{A}_{1/0}(\vec{\sigma})}$





HOLOGRAPHIC ENTANGLEMENT IN SUN NETWORK STATES: HORIZON-LIKE REGIONS FROM VOLUME CORRELATIONS



 $\beta = \log d_j$ inverse Ising temperature $^{\mathfrak{O}_{\bullet}}$

$$\overline{Z} = \sum_{\vec{\sigma}} e^{-\beta H(\vec{\sigma})} \qquad H(\vec{\sigma}) = -\frac{1}{2} \left[\sum_{e \in L} (\sigma_v \sigma_w - 1) + \sum_{e \in \partial \gamma} (\sigma_v \mu_e - 1) \right] + \beta^{-1} S_2(\zeta; \downarrow)$$
area of domain wall
$$|\Sigma(\vec{\sigma})|$$

$$\beta \gg 1: F = -\log \overline{Z} \approx \beta \min_{\vec{\sigma}} H(\vec{\sigma})$$

Small bulk entropy contribution:

$$\overline{S_2(\rho_A)} \approx \underbrace{\log d_j \min_{\vec{\sigma}} |\Sigma(\vec{\sigma})|}_{\text{area law}} + \underbrace{S_2(\zeta;\downarrow)}_{\text{bulk correction}}$$

bulk area law for boundary entropy (with bulk induced corrections)



Large bulk entropy contribution:

$$\overline{S_2(\rho_A)} \approx \min_{\vec{\sigma}} \left\{ -\beta \frac{1}{2} \left[\sum_{e \in L} (\sigma_v \sigma_w - 1) + \sum_{e \in \partial_\gamma} (\sigma_v \mu_e - 1) \right] + S_2(\zeta;\downarrow) \right\}$$

EXAMPLE

Bulk entanglement only in a region Ω :







The minimum of H is degenerate, the corresponding surfaces have area

$$|\Sigma_a| = |\Sigma_b| = 5$$



If intertwiner entanglement is present in a region Ω , the degeneracy of the minimal energy is removed:

$$\Sigma_a|=6,\,|\Sigma_b|=7$$



By increasing the dimension of the bulk disk Ω via refinement of vertices, the minimal-energy surface is performances. entering it:







H(r) = Ising-like Hamiltonian of a configuration whose domain wall Σ_r lies between shell r and shell r - 1

bulk entanglement not present

condition for the minimal-energy surface to drop from shell r + I to shell r:

 $H(r+1) > H(r) \iff d_{j_{r+1}} > d_{j_r}^{\frac{|A|+2}{A}}$





bulk entanglement present for $r \leq R$

condition for the minimal-energy surface to enter the disk Ω of radius R:

$$H(R+1) - H(R) > 0 \iff \underbrace{2 - d_{j_R}^{\frac{|A|+2}{A}}}_{\text{negative}} > \frac{d_{j_R}^{1 + \frac{|A|+2}{A}}}{d_{j_{R+1}}}$$





CONCLUSIONS



Tool: for spin network states with **random vertex weights**, entropy calculation translates into the evaluation of the free energy of a dual **lsing model**

BULK-TO-BOUNDARY ISOMETRIES

- ✓ Quantum gravity states associated to open graphs define **bulk/boundary maps** in the language of tensor networks
- ✓ Bulk-to-boundary maps of homogeneous graph made of four-valent vertices, each of them with at most one boundary link, cannot be isometric
- ✓ For generic graphs made of four-valent vertices, increasing the inhomogeneity of the spin assignment increases the holographic character of the map

HORIZON-LIKE REGIONS FROM VOLUME CORRELATIONS

- ✓ Bulk area law for boundary entropy for null (or small) values of the bulk entropy (with bulk-induced corrections)
- Emergence of a horizon-like surface: when a bulk region with high entanglement entropy is present, the Ising domain wall cannot enter it

FUTURE STEPS



- Generalization of the analysis to
 - spin superposition (entropy from a class of combinatorially equivalent Ising models)
 - graph superposition: by enriching the spin network with data encoding the amount of link-entanglement between vertices (entropy calculation mapped to random Ising model)
 - GFT condensate states
- Information-theoretic characterization of black hole horizons
 - derivation of a "threshold condition" for the emergence of horizon-like surfaces in the bulk, analogously to the one obtained from the typicality approach to the study of the local behavior of spin networks [Chirco, Anzà 2017]
 - Numerical simulation of boundary entropy and its phase transition through random tensor network techniques
- Implementation of the dynamics Several possibilities dictated by the QG approach (Loop quantum gravity, Spin foams, Group field theories...).
 - Quasi-local holographic dualities in 3d quantum gravity [Dittrich, Goeller, Livine, Riello 2017] bulk quantum geometrodynamics (given by Ponzano-Regge state-sum model)

 → 2d statistical models
 - LQG boundary dynamics as a 2+1-dimensional SL(2,C) gauge theory [Livine 2021]