Title: Non-causal Page-Wootters circuits

Speakers: Veronika Baumann

Collection: Quantizing Time

Date: June 14, 2021 - 11:20 AM

URL: http://pirsa.org/21060090

Abstract: "The process matrix framework was invented to capture a phenomenon known as indefinite or quantum causal structure. Due to the generality of that framework, however, for many process matrices there is no clear physical interpretation. A popular approach towards a quantum theory of gravity is the Page-Wootters formalism, which associates to time a Hilbert space structure similar to spatial position. By explicitly introducing a quantum clock, it allows to describe time-evolution of systems via correlations between this clock and said systems encoded in history states. We combine the process matrix framework with a generalization of the Page-Wootters formalism in which one considers several observers, each with their own discrete quantum clock.

This allows for implementing processes with indefinite casual order. The description via a history state with multiple clocks imposes constraints on the implementability of process matrices intros framework and on the perspectives of the observers. We describe how to to implement processes were the different definite causal orders are coherently controlled and explain why certain non-causal processes might not be implementable within this setting."

Non-causal Page Wootters circuits The Page-Wootters formulation of indefinite causal order

Veronika Baumann

with Marius Krumm, Philippe Allard Guèrin and Časlav Brukner

June 14, 2021

arXiv:2105.02304

Indefinite causal order [1]



purified operations: U_A and U_B

 $\mathcal{G}(U_A, U_B)$

[1] O. Oreshkov, F. Costa, and C. Brukner. Nature Commun., 3:1092, 2012.

Indefinite causal order [1]



purified operations: $U_{A_1} \dots U_{A_N}$ $\mathcal{G}(U_{A_1} \dots U_{A_N}) \dots$ unitary

Pure process \mathcal{G} .

[1] O. Oreshkov, F. Costa, and C. Brukner. Nature Commun., 3:1092, 2012.

Non-causal and physical processes

 ${\cal G}$ incompatible with a global causal order \ldots non-causal processes

Only purifyable processes are physical [2], reversibly map a global causal past to a global causal future.



An agent's perspective inside a (non-causal) pure process.



[3] P. Allard Guérin and C. Brukner. New Journal of Physics, 20(10):103031, 2018.

An agent's perspective inside a (non-causal) pure process.

$$\mathcal{G}(U_A, U_B) = \Phi_B(U_A) \left(U_B \otimes \mathbb{1} \right) \Pi_B(U_A)$$





[3] P. Allard Guérin and C. Brukner. New Journal of Physics, 20(10):103031, 2018.

An agent's perspective inside a (non-causal) pure process.



An agent's perspective inside a (non-causal) pure process.



[3] P. Allard Guérin and C. Brukner. New Journal of Physics, 20(10):103031, 2018.

The Page-Wootters formalism [4,5]

Combined Hilbert space of system and clock $\mathcal{H}_c \otimes \mathcal{H}_S$.

Physical states satisfy a constraint equation: $\hat{C}|\Psi
angle
angle=0$

$$\hat{C} = \hat{P}_t \otimes \mathbb{1} + \mathbb{1} \otimes \hat{H}_S : |\Psi\rangle\rangle = \int \mathrm{d}t \; |t\rangle_c \otimes |\psi(t)\rangle_S$$



Page Wootters circuits [6,7]

Clock system performs a finite number of ticks.

Model quantum circuites:





[7] A. Yu. Kitaev, A. H. Shen, and M. N. Vyalyi. Classical and Quantum Computation, 2002.

Page Wootters circuits [6,7]

Clock system performs a finite number of ticks.

Model quantum circuites:



[6] R. P. Feynman. Optics news, 11(2):11-20, 1985.

[7] A. Yu. Kitaev, A. H. Shen, and M. N. Vyalyi. Classical and Quantum Computation, 2002.

Associate a clock with each agent ... continuous case [8]

Consider discrete quantum clocks. $|\Psi\rangle\rangle \in \mathcal{H}_c \otimes \mathcal{H}_S \otimes \mathcal{H}_{S'}$ $\mathcal{H}_c = \mathcal{H}_{c_{A_1}} \otimes \mathcal{H}_{c_{A_2}} \cdots \otimes \mathcal{H}_{c_{A_N}}$ $\mathcal{H}_{S'} = \mathcal{H}_{A'_1} \otimes \mathcal{H}_{A'_2} \cdots \otimes \mathcal{H}_{A'_N}$

$$|\Psi\rangle\rangle = \sum_{t_{A_1}=0,\dots,t_{A_N}=0}^{T_{A_1}\dots,T_{A_N}} |t_{A_1},\dots,t_{A_N}\rangle_c \otimes |\psi(t_{A_1}\dots,t_{A_N})\rangle_{SS'}.$$

 $|0\ldots 0\rangle_c \otimes |\psi\rangle_S |0\rangle_{S'} \qquad |T_{A_1}\ldots T_{A_N}\rangle_c \otimes \mathcal{G}(U_{A_1}\ldots U_{A_N})|\psi\rangle_S |0\rangle_{S'}$

Definite causal order

One synchronized tick of all clocks at the start and the end.

[8] E. Castro-Ruiz, F. Giacomini, A. Belenchia, and C. Brukner. Nature Commun., 11(1):2672, 2020.



Perspectival states of agent X:

$$|\psi_X(t_X)\rangle = N_{t_X}^{(X)} \langle t_X | \Psi \rangle \rangle = \langle t_X |_{c_X} \otimes N_{t_X}^{(X)} | \Psi \rangle \rangle,$$

 $N_{t_X}^{(X)} \in \mathcal{L}(\mathcal{H}_{c_{\setminus X}} \otimes \mathcal{H}_S \otimes \mathcal{H}_{S'})$ is the normalization operator.

• unitarily related:

$$|\psi_X(t_X)\rangle = \mathcal{U}_X(t_X, t'_X)|\psi_X(t'_X)\rangle$$

perspectival unitary \mathcal{U}_X .

• time of action t_X^* :

$$\mathcal{U}_X(t_X^*, t_X^* - 1) = U_X \otimes \operatorname{Rest}^{(X)}$$



Properties of non-causal Page-Wootters circuits

Perspectival states give refined causal reference frames

$$\begin{array}{l} A_1:\\ |T_{A_2}\dots T_{A_N}\rangle_{c_{\backslash A_1}}\otimes |\psi(T_{A_1},T_{A_2},\dots T_{A_N})\rangle =\\ & \left(\mathcal{U}_{A_1}(T_{A_1},t_{A_1}^*)(U_{A_1}\otimes \operatorname{Rest}^{(A_1)})\mathcal{U}_{A_1}(t_{A_1}^*-1,0)\right)|0,\dots 0\rangle_{c_{\backslash A_1}}\otimes |\psi(0,0,\dots 0)\rangle.\\ & \uparrow & \uparrow\\ & \mathsf{causal\ future\ of\ }A_1 & \mathsf{causal\ past\ of\ }A_1 \end{array}$$

Affine-linearity:

The \mathcal{U}_{A_X} consist of terms that are either *linear* or *constant* in all the operations $U_{A_1} \dots U_{A_N}$!





Causal process:

 $\mathcal{G}(U_A, U_B) = (\mathbb{1} \otimes U_B) V(U_A \otimes \mathbb{1})$



$$\begin{split} |\Psi\rangle\rangle = &|0_A, 0_B\rangle_c \otimes |\phi\rangle + |1_A, 1_B\rangle_c \otimes |\phi\rangle \\ &+ |2_A, 2_B\rangle_c \otimes (U_A \otimes \mathbb{1}) |\phi\rangle + |2_A, 3_B\rangle_c \otimes (U_A \otimes \mathbb{1}) |\phi\rangle \\ &+ |3_A, 4_B\rangle_c \otimes V(U_A \otimes \mathbb{1}) |\phi\rangle + |3_A, 5_B\rangle_c \otimes V(U_A \otimes \mathbb{1}) |\phi\rangle \\ &+ |4_A, 6_B\rangle_c \otimes (\mathbb{1} \otimes U_B) V(U_A \otimes \mathbb{1}) |\phi\rangle + |4_A, 7_B\rangle_c \otimes |\psi\rangle \\ &+ |5_A, 8_B\rangle_c \otimes |\psi\rangle + |6_A, 9_B\rangle_c \otimes |\psi\rangle \end{split}$$

Alice's perspective:

$$\begin{split} |\psi_A(0)\rangle &= |0_B\rangle_{c_B} \otimes |\phi\rangle, \\ |\psi_A(1)\rangle &= |1_B\rangle_{c_B} \otimes |\phi\rangle, \\ |\psi_A(2)\rangle &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(|2_B\rangle + |3_B\rangle)_{c_B} \otimes (U_A \otimes \mathbb{1})|\phi\rangle, \\ \text{with } N_2^{(A)} &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}\mathbb{1}_S, \\ |\psi_A(3)\rangle &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(|4_B\rangle + |5_B\rangle)_{c_B} \otimes V(U_A \otimes \mathbb{1})|\phi\rangle \\ \text{with } N_3^{(A)} &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}\mathbb{1}_S \\ |\psi_A(4)\rangle &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}(|6_B\rangle + |7_B\rangle)_{c_B} \otimes (\mathbb{1} \otimes U_B)V(U_A \otimes \mathbb{1})|\phi\rangle \\ \text{with } N_4^{(A)} &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{2}}\mathbb{1}_S, \\ |\psi_A(5)\rangle &= |8_B\rangle_{c_B} \otimes \mathcal{G}(U_A, U_B)|\phi\rangle, \\ |\psi_A(6)\rangle &= |9_B\rangle_{c_B} \otimes \mathcal{G}(U_A, U_B)|\phi\rangle \end{split}$$

Alice's perspective:

$$\mathcal{U}_A(1,0)=T_{c_B}\otimes \mathbb{1}_{\mathbb{S}},$$

 $\mathcal{U}_A(2,1) = (T_2')_{c_B} \otimes (U_A \otimes \mathbb{1})_S, \quad t_B^* = 2$

$$\mathcal{U}_A(3,2) = (T^2)_{c_B} \otimes V_S,$$

 $\mathcal{U}_A(4,3) = (T^2)_{c_B} \otimes (\mathbb{1} \otimes U_B)_S,$

$$\mathcal{U}_A(5,4) = (T_6')_{c_B} \otimes \mathbb{1}_S,$$

$$\mathcal{U}_A(6,5) = T_{c_B} \otimes \mathbb{1}_S$$

Bob's perspective:

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{U}_{B}(1,0) &= T_{c_{A}} \otimes \mathbb{1}_{S}, \\ \mathcal{U}_{B}(2,1) &= T_{c_{A}} \otimes (U_{A} \otimes \mathbb{1})_{S}, \\ \mathcal{U}_{B}(3,2) &= \mathbb{1}, \\ \mathcal{U}_{B}(4,3) &= T_{c_{A}} \otimes V_{S}, \\ \mathcal{U}_{B}(5,4) &= \mathbb{1}, \\ \mathcal{U}_{B}(6,5) &= T_{c_{A}} \otimes (\mathbb{1} \otimes U_{B})_{S}, \quad t_{B}^{*} = 6 \\ \mathcal{U}_{B}(7,6) &= \mathbb{1}, \\ \mathcal{U}_{B}(8,7) &= T_{c_{A}} \otimes \mathbb{1}_{S}, \\ \mathcal{U}_{B}(9,8) &= T_{c_{A}} \otimes \mathbb{1}_{S} \end{aligned}$$

The quantum switch [9]

Coherent control of the order of operations:



Causal reference frames:



Indefinite causal order:

 $\mathcal{G}(U_A, U_B) = |0\rangle \langle 0| \otimes U_B U_A + |1\rangle \langle 1| \otimes U_A U_B$

$$\begin{split} |\Psi\rangle\rangle &= |0_A, 0_B\rangle_c \otimes |\phi\rangle + |1_A, 1_B\rangle_c \otimes |\phi\rangle + |2_A, 2_B\rangle_c \otimes |\phi\rangle \\ &+ |3_A, 2_B\rangle_c \otimes (|0\rangle\langle 0| \otimes \mathbb{1})|\phi\rangle + |2_A, 3_B\rangle_c \otimes (|1\rangle\langle 1| \otimes \mathbb{1})|\phi\rangle \\ &+ |4_A, 3_B\rangle_c \otimes (|0\rangle\langle 0| \otimes U_A)|\phi\rangle + |3_A, 4_B\rangle_c (|1\rangle\langle 1| \otimes U_B)|\phi\rangle \\ &+ |5_A, 4_B\rangle_c \otimes (|0\rangle\langle 0| \otimes U_BU_A)|\phi\rangle + |4_A, 5_B\rangle_c \otimes (|1\rangle\langle 1| \otimes U_AU_B)|\phi\rangle \\ &+ |5_A, 5_B\rangle_c \otimes (|0\rangle\langle 0| \otimes U_BU_A + |1\rangle\langle 1| \otimes U_AU_B)|\phi\rangle \\ &+ |6_A, 6_B\rangle_c \otimes \mathcal{G}(U_A, U_B)|\phi\rangle + |7_A, 7_B\rangle_c \otimes \mathcal{G}(U_A, U_B)|\phi\rangle, \end{split}$$

Indefinite causal order:

 $\mathcal{G}(U_A, U_B) = |0\rangle \langle 0| \otimes U_B U_A + |1\rangle \langle 1| \otimes U_A U_B$

$$\begin{split} |\Psi\rangle\rangle &= |0_{A}, 0_{B}\rangle_{c} \otimes |\phi\rangle + |1_{A}, 1_{B}\rangle_{c} \otimes |\phi\rangle + |2_{A}, 2_{B}\rangle_{c} \otimes |\phi\rangle \\ &+ |3_{A}, 2_{B}\rangle_{c} \otimes (|0\rangle\langle 0| \otimes 1)|\phi\rangle + |2_{A}, 3_{B}\rangle_{c} \otimes (|1\rangle\langle 1| \otimes 1)|\phi\rangle \\ &+ |4_{A}, 3_{B}\rangle_{c} \otimes (|0\rangle\langle 0| \otimes U_{A})|\phi\rangle + |3_{A}, 4_{B}\rangle_{c} (|1\rangle\langle 1| \otimes U_{B})|\phi\rangle \\ &+ |5_{A}, 4_{B}\rangle_{c} \otimes (|0\rangle\langle 0| \otimes U_{B}U_{A})|\phi\rangle + |4_{A}, 5_{B}\rangle_{c} \otimes (|1\rangle\langle 1| \otimes U_{A}U_{B})|\phi\rangle \\ &+ |5_{A}, 5_{B}\rangle_{c} \otimes (|0\rangle\langle 0| \otimes U_{B}U_{A} + |1\rangle\langle 1| \otimes U_{A}U_{B})|\phi\rangle \\ &+ |6_{A}, 6_{B}\rangle_{c} \otimes \mathcal{G}(U_{A}, U_{B})|\phi\rangle + |7_{A}, 7_{B}\rangle_{c} \otimes \mathcal{G}(U_{A}, U_{B})|\phi\rangle, \end{split}$$

desynchronization

resynchronization

 $\mathcal{U}_A(1,0) = T_{c_B} \otimes \mathbb{1}_S$

 $\mathcal{U}_A(2,1) = T_{c_B} \otimes (|0\rangle \langle 0| \otimes \mathbb{1})_S + (T_2')_{c_B} \otimes (|1\rangle \langle 1| \otimes \mathbb{1})_S$

 $\mathcal{U}_A(3,2) = \mathbb{1}_{c_B} \otimes (|0\rangle \langle 0| \otimes \mathbb{1})_S + (T_2')_{c_B} \otimes (|1\rangle \langle 1| \otimes U_B)_S$

Alice's perspective: $\mathcal{U}_A(4,3) = T_{c_B} \otimes (\mathbb{1} \otimes U_A)_S, \quad t_A^* = 4$

 $\mathcal{U}_A(5,4) = (T_4')_{c_B} \otimes (|0\rangle \langle 0| \otimes U_B)_S + \mathbb{1}_{c_B} \otimes (|1\rangle \langle 1| \otimes \mathbb{1})_S$

 $\mathcal{U}_A(6,5) = (T_4')_{c_B} \otimes (|0\rangle \langle 0| \otimes \mathbb{1})_S + T_{c_B} \otimes (|1\rangle \langle 1| \otimes \mathbb{1})_S$

$$\mathcal{U}_A(7,6) = T_{c_B} \otimes \mathbb{1}_S$$

The quantum switch [9]

Bob's perspective is analogous. $|0\rangle_{S_c} \leftrightarrow |1\rangle_{S_c}$



Similar procedure works for any coherent control of causal order.

The Lugano process [10]

A pure non-causal process that is not an example of coherent control of causal order.

... time-reversed version:

 $\begin{aligned} \mathcal{G}(U_A, U_B, U_C) |jjj\rangle &= U_A \otimes U_B \otimes U_C |jjj\rangle \\ \mathcal{G}(U_A, U_B, U_C) |j01\rangle &= XU_A \otimes U_B \otimes U_C |j01\rangle \\ \mathcal{G}(U_A, U_B, U_C) |1j0\rangle &= U_A \otimes XU_B \otimes U_C |1j0\rangle \\ \mathcal{G}(U_A, U_B, U_C) |01j\rangle &= U_A \otimes U_B \otimes XU_C |01j\rangle \end{aligned}$

with $j \in \{0,1\}$.

[10] Ä. Baumeler and S. Wolf. New Journal of Physics, 18(1):013036, 2016.

The Lugano process [10]

A pure non-causal process that is not an example of coherent control of causal order.

... time-reversed version:

$$\begin{aligned} \mathcal{G}(U_A, U_B, U_C) |jjj\rangle &= U_A \otimes U_B \otimes U_C |jjj\rangle \\ \mathcal{G}(U_A, U_B, U_C) |j01\rangle &= XU_A \otimes U_B \otimes U_C |j01\rangle \\ \mathcal{G}(U_A, U_B, U_C) |1j0\rangle &= U_A \otimes XU_B \otimes U_C |1j0\rangle \\ \mathcal{G}(U_A, U_B, U_C) |01j\rangle &= U_A \otimes U_B \otimes XU_C |01j\rangle \end{aligned}$$

with $j \in \{0, 1\}$.



[10] Ä. Baumeler and S. Wolf. New Journal of Physics, 18(1):013036, 2016.

Thank you!